Wilmington Area Planning Council

New Castle Co., Delaware

Cecil County, Maryland

660,000 people
### Selected “Hard to Reach” Communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blacks</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanics</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low-income</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No broadband</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited English</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low-literacy</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage with WILMAPCO Region
2019 Transportation Justice Plan
2019 Transportation Justice Plan

Title VI of the Civil Rights Act

Environmental Justice
Language Assistance
Americans with Disabilities Act

Prepared by the staff of the Wilmington Area Planning Council

The preparation of this document was financed in part by the Federal Government, including the Federal Transit Administration and the Federal Highway Administration of the United States Department of Transportation

DATA REPORT
Urban Technology Deserts
Identification, Analyses & Implications

December 2020

Overview
Technology deserts are places where many households lack reliable computer and internet access. This can be due to lack of infrastructure, such as broadband connectivity, or, in urban areas, demographic and socio-economic conditions. We find clusters of households with high poverty and/or subsidized housing characterizes what can be called “urban tech deserts” in the WILMAPCO region.

During the Coronavirus pandemic and associated lockdown of 2020, school, office work, and shopping migrated online, so this digital outreach became the default and often only means planners used to engage residents. While the majority of households accustomed to (and some may have benefited from) this shift, others with limited technological capability struggled. If they persist, the resultant disparities in access to education, public input opportunities, and more, threaten to widen existing economic and racial inequities in our society.

The map below shows technology deserts in the region. These are places home to more than 100 households without access to a computer (including a smartphone) and/or household internet access.
Today’s Key Themes

Measure trends

Aim for representative samples

Empower communities
Regional Public Opinion Survey

I have heard of WILMAPCO (by annual income)

- Under $25K: 10%
- $25K to $50K: 19%
- $50K to $100K: 29%
- More than $100K: 43%
I have heard of WILMAPCO (by race/ethnicity)

- **White**: 38%
- **Hispanic**: 18%
- **Black**: 19%
Regional Public Opinion Survey

Public Advisory Committee Membership

Regional Ethnic/Racial Minority Population

- 2006: 4%
- 2012: 18%
- 2019: 16%
### Meeting Outreach Standards?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>North Claymont Area Master Plan</th>
<th>Route 9 Corridor Master Plan</th>
<th>Route 141 Land Use and Transportation Plan</th>
<th>Glasgow Avenue Planning Study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community representatives invited to participate in committees</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>businesses, etc.) engaged throughout planning process</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webpage created</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media presence established</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visioning workshop held early in the planning process</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow-up workshop(s) held</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops held in ADA-accessible, convenient, and unimposing (nongovernmental, non-business) location</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variety of visualization techniques used during workshop/outreach (written, graphic, oral, etc.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variety of methods to collect public feedback (online, verbal, paper, etc.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least two weeks notice given for all public workshops</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wide advertisement for workshop notices: web, social media, flyers, radio, community events, etc.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops well attended</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific outreach and support to LEP and low-literacy populations, if present, in study area</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific outreach to low income and minority populations, if present, in study area</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Selected measures and plans
2017 Regional Progress Report
Measure Trends - Takeaways

Measure where you are
Builds case for intervention/change

Measure where you have been
Is progress being made?
Take the test

The results from BBC Lab UK’s Great British Class Survey reveal a brand new class system of seven groups.

Answer five questions to see where you fit in:

Tell us about you


https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0038038513481128
Whites Overrepresented in Planning Surveys

Wilmington Comp Plan Survey*

- 61%

Actual City Population

- 29%

*Final data weighted to correct overrepresentation by neighborhood
Whites Overrepresented in Planning Surveys

City of New Castle Comp Plan Survey: 91%

Actual City Population: 64%
Whites Overrepresented in Planning Surveys

WILMAPCO 2020 PPP Survey

- 91%

Actual Regional Population

- 63%
Whites in WILMAPCO’s RTP Phone Surveys*

2010 – no quotas

Survey: 78%  
Actual: 63%

2018 – w/quotas

Survey: 64%  
Actual: 59%

*New Castle Co., Delaware data
Engagement Approaches

- Passive
  - Stakeholders
  - Workshop
- Active
  - Events
  - Mobile engagement
  - Online
How People Engaged

- Stakeholders: 28%
- Events: 67%
- Mobile engagement: 4%
- Workshop: 4%
How People Engaged

- Stakeholders: 28%
- Events: 67%
- Mobile engagement: 4%
- Workshop: 28%
- Online: 67%
Urban Technology Deserts

- **NO INTERNET**: 40%
- **NO COMPUTER**: 26%
- **BLACKS**: 53%

**REGION**

- 6%
- 10%
- 22%
Emerging low-tech outreach at WILMAPCO

- Telephone-based meetings
- Text messaging question/response collection
- Meetings in parks
- Targeted door-to-door via paid community workers
- Mail back surveys
Know Community Characteristics
Know Community Characteristics

- Environmental Justice areas
- Mobility Challenged areas
- Social Determinants of Health index
- Limited English – Spanish language
- Limited English – Asian language
- Low-literacy areas
- Tech deserts
Representative Sample - Takeaways

Shoot for representative sample
- Race, ethnicity, income, age, place, etc.

Requires deliberative engagement & tracking
- Hard survey quotas, multi-point methods
- Online outreach will not work everywhere
Spectrum of Public Participation

Inform  Consult  Involve  Collaborate  Empower

Increasing Level of Public Impact

American Planning Association, 2019
Spectrum of Public Participation

- Action teams
- Delegated responsibility
- Creation of non-profits
- Leadership development

Support the aspirations of the public and contribute to the implementation of their plans.
Key Practices*

*Urban Institute, 2018
Empower Communities – Lessons & Takeaways

Invest in trust building
Listen & act for community good

Make it a team effort
Planners & civic leaders collaborating

Neither have all the answers
Empower Communities – Lessons & Takeaways

Ensure transparency
Good documentation
Develop shared vision/mission

Don’t be afraid to make mistakes
It happens!
2019
Transportation Justice Plan

Title VI of the Civil Rights Act

Environmental Justice
Language Assistance

Americans with Disabilities Act

Prepared by the staff of the
Wilmington Area Planning Council

The preparation of this document was financed in part by the Federal Government, including the Federal Transit Administration and the Federal Highways Administration of the United States Department of Transportation.

wilmapco.org/tj

Bill Swiatek, AICP
Principal Planner

302-737-6205 x113
bswiatek@wilmapco.org